c. Critique of Freud's Concept of Sexuality (1911)

COMMENT *In the autumn of 1902 Freud, according to Ernest Jones,[1] addressed a postcard to Adler, Max Kahane, Rudolf Reitler, and Wilhelm Stekel, suggesting that they meet at his apartment for discussions of the psychology of the neuroses. This was the beginning of the Vienna Psychoanalytic Society. Kahane and Reitler had attended Freud's university lectures, while Stekel had been a patient of Freud. In explanation of Adler's invitation his biographers have reported that he had written a letter to a newspaper in in defense of Freud's* The Interpretation of Dreams. *We have not been able to verify this, but neither have we found any other explanation why Adler was invited.*

On the other hand, Jones[2] and Carl Furtmüller (44) agree that there was never a close personal relationship between Adler and Freud. Still, Adler was one of the most valued members of the Vienna Psychoanalytic Society, eventually its president, and co-editor with Freud and Stekel of the Zentralblatt für Psychoanalyse, *as mentioned initially (p. 3). Thus when Adler now become Freud's critic, he was well qualified. His understanding of psychoanalysis was probably second only to Freud's.*

When the difference in theory between Adler and Freud had become acute, the Vienna Psychoanalytic Society, of which Adler was then president, decided to hear a comprehensive presentation of his theories, which the members could discuss at length. Adler read three papers in the course of these meetings, the last on February 1, 1911 (24, pp. 230–231). Selections from these papers, as found in Heilen und Bilden, *are presented in this and in the next two sections. This series of addresses represented the culmination of a development which led to Adler's resignation from his psychoanalytic offices and his complete separation from Freud.*

1. LIMITATION OF THE SEX DRIVE[10]

It is idle to ask whether a neurosis is possible without inclusion of the sex drive. After all, it has a similarly great significance in the life of everyone. The real question is whether the beginning and the end and all the symptom formations of the neurosis are to be found in the fate of the

[1] Jones, E. *The Life and Work of Sigmund Freud.* Vol. 2. New York: Basic Books, 1955, pp. 7 and 8.
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 131.

sex drive. I must answer this question with a brief description, not of the isolated sex drive, but of its development in the ensemble of the drives.

Biologically speaking it would not be possible to maintain that every drive has a sexual component, including the drive to eat, the drive to see, and the drive to touch. One must assume rather that organic evolution has led to developments which we must regard as the differentiation of originally present potentialities of the cell. Thus a nutritive organ has followed the will and need of assimilation; touch, auditory, and visual organs have followed the will and necessity to feel, hear, and see; a procreative organ followed the will and necessity for progeny.

The protection of all these organs became so necessary that it was approached from two sides: through the sensations of pain and of pleasure. But this was not enough, and thus a third safeguard developed in the form of the organ of prudence, the organ of thinking, the brain. In the laboratory of nature, all three safeguards can be found. While peripheral defects or accentuated pain and pleasure sensations may arise in the inferior organ, the most variable part, the central nervous system, takes over the final compensation.

COMMENT *What Adler does here in fact is to state his position as a centralistic rather than a peripheralistic psychologist. It is the central nervous system which inaugurates the compensation, thus making all peripheral functions, including sex, subordinate to one central function. Later the safeguarding tendency virtually replaced compensation.*

2. RELATIVITY OF LIBIDO[11]

It is a double wrong to confuse the concept of the inferior organ with the "erogenous zone" of Havelock Ellis. First, only a small part of the inferior organs shows an increased pleasure feeling or feels a tickle in its peripheral part. Should one, as Sadger attempts, count the inferior urinary passage, gall bladder, pancreas, adenoids, and lymph glands among the erogenous zones? Second, the concept of the erogenous zone is unjustly prejudiced. We do not want to deny that conscious and unconscious perverse fantasies may be associated with the inferior organ. But this occurs only later in life, with the aid of false notions about sex or under the pressure of certain safeguarding tendencies. In order to become erogenous, such zones need a secondary confluence of drives under the pressure of

mistaken sexual theories or conflicting superfluous safeguarding tendencies.

The statement that the child is a polymorphous pervert, is a hysteron proteron [reverses the order of things], is a poetic license. The "sexual constitution" can be cultivated at will through experiences and education, especially on the basis of organ inferiorities. Even prematurity can be kept down or advanced. Sadistic and masochistic impulses are simply a development from the more harmless relationships of the regularly present need for support and the impulse toward independence once the masculine protest is involved with its intensification of rage, anger, and defiance.

COMMENT *The term polymorphous pervert had been used by Freud in the following connections. "I have described in my* Drei Abhandlungen zur Sexualtheorie *how the constitutional disposition of the child is by far more variegated than we might have expected, how it deserves to be called 'polymorphously perverse,' and how what is called the normal sexual function develops from this disposition through certain components of it becoming repressed . . . I was able to designate neurosis as the 'negative' of perversion" (36, I, p. 280). "In this respect, the child perhaps does not behave differently from the average uncultured woman in whom the same polymorphous-perverse disposition exists . . . The same polymorphous or infantile disposition fits the prostitute for her professional activity. Still it is absolutely impossible not to recognize in the uniform disposition of all perversions a universal and primitive human tendency, as shown by an enormous number of prostitutes and by many women who do not necessarily follow this calling" (33, pp. 592–593).*

Only the sexual organ, and it alone, develops the sexual factor in real life and in the neurosis. If sexuality enters relations with the total drive life and its causes, the same is true of any other drive. Before the sex drive has reached a degree worth mentioning, approximately at the end of the first year, the psychological life of the child is already richly developed. Freud mentions the view of old authors, who were joined by Czerny, that children who are stubborn on the toilet often become nervous. In contrast to other authors, he traces this defiance to the fact that they have sexual pleasure-feelings during retention of feces. Although I have seen no incontestable case of this sort, I do not wish to deny that children who have such sensations when they retain feces will prefer precisely this kind of resistance when they become defiant. But here, nevertheless, it is the defiance which is decisive, while the organ inferiority determines the

localization and selection of the symptoms. I have much more frequently observed that such defiant children produce the feces before or after they have been brought to the toilet or right next to the toilet; the same is true of the urination of such children. It is the same with eating and drinking; we need only to curb the drinking of certain children, and their libido increases into infinity; we need only to tell them that eating regularly is important, and their libido drops to zero. Can we take such "libido quantities" seriously, let alone energetically, and use them for comparisons? I have seen a thirteen-month-old boy who had barely learned to stand and to walk. If we sat him down, he got up; if we told him, "Sit down," he remained standing and looked mischievous. His six-year-old sister said on one such occasion, "Keep standing," and the child sat down. These are the beginnings of the masculine protest. The sexuality which is meanwhile budding is continuously exposed to its impacts and urges.

I have pointed out in several papers that especially children who have a noticeable organ inferiority, who suffer from defects, who are insecure, and who fear humiliation and punishment the most develop the craving and haste which ultimately dispose to neurosis. At an early age they will avoid tests of their worth or evade injuries to their sensitivity. They are bashful, blush easily, evade any test of their ability, and lose at an early age their spontaneity. This uncomfortable condition strongly urges toward safeguards. They want to be petted or want to do everything alone, are afraid of any kind of work, or read incessantly. As a rule they are precocious. Their thirst for knowledge is a compensatory product of their insecurity and reaches at an early age toward questions about birth and sex differences. This strained and continuous fantasy activity must be understood as a stimulus for the sex drive as soon as the primitive knowledge of sex processes has been achieved. Here, as well, their goal is to prove their masculinity.

3. SEX AND THE MASCULINE PROTEST[12]

Again we ask if that which the neurotic shows as libido is to be taken at face value. We would say no. His sexual prematurity is forced. His compulsion to masturbate serves his defiance and as a safeguard against the demon woman, and his love-passion only aims at victory. His love-bondage is a game which aims at not submitting to the "right" partner, and his perverted fantasies, even his active perversions, serve him only to keep him away from actual love. They of course serve him as a substitute,

but only because he wants to play his hero role and because he is afraid of getting caught under the wheels if he goes the normal way. The so-called core problem of the neurosis, the incest fantasy, usually nourishes the belief in one's own overpowering libido and therefore avoids as much as possible any "real" danger.

How, then, does sexuality come into the neurosis and what part does it play there? It is awakened early and stimulated when existing inferiority and a strong masculine protest are present; it is regarded and felt in gigantic proportions so that the patient may safeguard himself in good time; or it is devaluated and eliminated as a factor if this serves the tendency of the patient. In general it is impossible to take the sexual impulses of the neurotic or of civilized man as genuine and to count on them, let alone to continue to represent them, no matter how they are viewed, as the fundamental factor of the healthy or diseased mental life. They are never causes, but always worked-over material and means of personal striving.

D. Critique of Other Freudian Concepts (1911)

1. REPRESSION[13]

I may presuppose in this circle a knowledge of repression as this has been outlined and described by Freud. The causes of the repression, however, and the path which leads from the repression to the neurosis are by no means as clear as one generally assumes in the Freudian school. The number of auxiliary constructs which appear in attempts of explanation are exceedingly great, and they often turn out to be unproven, even unprovable. Constructs which, in the most obvious manner, take recourse to an analogy from physics or chemistry by speaking of damming up, increased pressure, fixation, flowing back into infantile paths, projections, and regression must also be mentioned.

COMMENT *It is, of course, no accident that Freud chose analogies from physics or chemistry. Rather, these are an expression of his ontological position as a reductionistic natural scientist. As such, he hoped that ultimately psychology could be reduced to physiology and chemistry. Thus we find the following significant statement by Freud in a discussion of processes related to the life and death instincts: "The deficiencies in our description would probably vanish if we were already in a position to replace the psychological terms by physiological or chemical ones" (34, p. 83).*

In the papers of this school, the causes of the repression are conceived too summarily and as dogmatically used stereotypes. Yet these expositions contain elements of intuition, the basis of which is always worth determining. If we trace repression back to the "sexual constitution," the problem of successful and unsuccessful repression becomes all the more mysterious. If we go no further than the simple statement of repression, we show a lack of psychological insight. The causes of sublimation and substitute formations are likewise not explained by repeating the same idea in different words. Organic repression appears, then, as nothing but an emergency exit, showing that changes in the modes of operation are possible. It has hardly any bearing on the theory of the neuroses. Repressed drives and drive components, repressed complexes, repressed fantasies, repressed events from life, and repressed wishes are considered under organic repression.

The real question is this: Is the driving factor in the neurosis the repression, or is it, as I should like to state it in neutral terms for the time being, the deviating, irritated psyche, in the examination of which repression can also be found?

COMMENT *Adler's definitely affirmative answer to this question appears in the next section under the side-heading,* Safeguarding tendencies in place of repression. *Freud, years later, modified his views in the direction of the Adlerian answer when he subsumed repression under the ego-defense-mechanisms (see p. 264). He then, indeed, recognized that repression was exerted by the ego, the equivalent of Adler's "irritated psyche" here.*

And now I beg you to consider the Freudian position: Repression takes place under the pressure of culture, under the pressure of the ego drives. In giving this explanation, the thoughts of an abnormal sexual constitution, of sexual prematurity are resorted to. Question: Where does our culture come from? Answer: From the repression.

COMMENT *In this question, Adler tersely accuses Freud of circular reasoning. The accusation did not go unanswered, although Freud took it as one of "playing with words" rather than circular reason-*

ing. His reply was: "What it means is simply that civilization is based upon the repressions effected by former generations, and that each fresh generation is required to maintain this civilization by effectuating the same repressions. I once heard of a child that thought people were laughing at it, and began to cry, because when it asked 'Where do eggs come from?' they told it 'From hens', and then when it went on to enquire where hens came from, they said 'From eggs.' But they were not playing with words; on the contrary, they were telling it the truth" (36, I, p. 346). The difference between Adler's "culture" and Freud's "civilization" is one of translation only; the original German word for both is Kultur.

At first the chicken-and-the-egg argument would seem irrefutable, but significantly, the child's crying furnishes the clue that there is something wrong here. Obviously the child did not find the answer to his question satisfactory. And why not? Because though they were telling him the truth, they remained on a level of superficial, one might say symptomatic, description, making no attempt to show the underlying genetic relationship. Similarly Freud's reply merely restates the original proposition which Adler criticized, without adding anything, or going any deeper.

Adler broke up this circularity by supplying the underlying explanatory principle in the form of the "psyche" or the self, subsequently formulated more dynamically as the individual's unique style of life. According to Adler, both repression and the culture are products of the self, the latter the common product of many selves.

The Adler-Freud controversy thus was one of the psychology with a soul against a psychology, where the soul or the self was eclipsed. In this connection, Allport is "inclined to believe history will declare that psychoanalysis marked an inter-regnum in psychology between the time when it lost its soul, shortly after the Franco-Prussian War, and the time when it found it again, shortly after World War II" (3, p. 116). If this is true, then Adler was one of the voices in the wilderness of pre-World War I days crying that the self or the soul must remain the focal point if psychology is to provide satisfactory explanations.

2. THE EGO-LIBIDO ANTITHESIS[14]

What about the "ego drives," a concept as redundant and empty of meaning as few others? Do they not have the same "libidinal" character as the sex drives?

COMMENT In spite of its brevity, this question contains perhaps the greatest indication of Adler's astuteness as a theoretician. Accepting for a moment, for the sake of argument, Freud's point of view, Adler here predicts the development which Freud took nine years later. In his important 1920 monograph, Freud actually saw the necessity of attributing to the ego instincts the same libidinal character as attributed to the sex instincts. Freud summarized the development of his new instinct theory as follows: "To begin with . . . we opposed the ego instincts to the sexual instincts of which the libido is the manifestation. Subsequently we came to closer grips with the analysis of the ego and recognized that a portion of the 'ego instincts' is also of a libidinal character and has taken the subject's own ego as its object. These narcissistic self-preservative instincts had thenceforward to be counted among the libidinal sexual instincts" (34, p. 84n).

But Freud replaced the ego vs. libido dualism by a new one. "Our views have from the very first been dualistic, and today they are even more definitely dualistic than before" (34, p. 72). "A fresh opposition appeared between the libidinal (ego and object) instincts and others, which must be presumed to be present in the ego and which may perhaps actually be observed in the destructive instincts. Our speculations have transformed this opposition into one between the life instincts (Eros) and the death instincts" (34, p. 84n).

3. PLEASURE PRINCIPLE AND BACKWARD ORIENTATION[15]

Above all this, there hovers, as deus ex machina, one magic formula, namely, that of pleasure. Of this Nietzsche says so well, "because all pleasure wants eternity, wants deep, deep eternity." And Freud says: "Man cannot forego any pleasure he has ever experienced." According to this proposition, those drastic forms arise which every work of a disciple of Freud must show: the boy who is compelled to suckle at his mother's breast; the neurotic who seeks again and again the enjoyment of being bathed in wine or amniotic fluid; on up to the purer sphere where the man who is seeking the right girl will never find her because he is seeking the irreplaceable mother. Although this method created an important step forward, it tended to reify and freeze the psyche which, in reality, is constantly at work contemplating future events. The fastening upon the concept of the complex was a further step in giving priority to the topological

view over the dynamic view. Naturally this was not carried so far that the principle of energetics, the *panta rhei* [constant flux], could not have been brought in as an afterthought.

COMMENT *When Freud revised his hedonic theory in 1920, he retained his backward orientation. The revision actually represented a further strengthening of the backward view through the new concept of "a compulsion to repeat, which overrides the pleasure principle" (34, p. 25). "But how is the predicate of being 'instinctual' related to the compulsion to repeat? . . . An instinct is a compulsion inherent in organic life to restore an earlier state of things which the living entity has been obliged to abandon under the pressure of external disturbing forces; that is, it is a kind of organic elasticity, or, to put it another way, the expression of the inertia in organic life" (34, pp. 46–47).*

As Adler did not fail to point out, the principle of energetics, by which he meant the forward movement, is actually brought in at this point by Freud, when he says in regard to the tendency of children to repeat unpleasurable experiences in their play: "Each fresh repetition seems to strengthen the mastery they are in search of" (34, p. 45). But it is indeed brought in as a subordinate thought and dismissed again toward the end of the same monograph.

E. Social Values Instead of Drives (1911)

1. THE RELATIVITY OF DRIVES[16]

The ego drives must be understood, not as something rigidified and separate, but as the tension and attitudes toward the environment, as a striving toward power, toward dominance, toward being above. In accordance with this view, two possibilities must be considered, from the theoretical as well as from the practical standpoint: Wanting to be significant may inhibit, repress, or modify certain drives, and wanting to be significant will effect primarily the enhancement of other drives.

For our consideration, the constant factor is the culture, the society, and its institutions. Our drives, the satisfaction of which has been considered the end, act merely as the direction-giving means to initiate the satisfactions in the distant future. The eye, the ear, and also the skin have acquired the peculiar ability to extend our radius of effectiveness beyond the bodily-spatial sphere. By means of pre-sensitivity, our psyche

steps beyond the present, that is, temporally beyond the limits of primitive drive-satisfaction. Here increased tensions are as urgent as repressions. In these relations [to the culture] rests the necessity for an extensive system of safeguards, one small part of which we must recognize in the neurosis.

These tensions begin on the first day of infancy and change all bodily and psychological tendencies to such an extent that, for example, what we see never represents something original or primary, something that has not been influenced, or something that has become changed only at a later time. Instead, the adaptation of the child directs and modifies the drives until he has adjusted himself in some way to the environment. In this first stage of life, one cannot speak of a permanent model nor of identification when the child orients himself by a model. For this is often the only way for immediate drive satisfaction.

If we consider the varied manner and tempo in which the satisfaction of drives has asserted itself everywhere and at all times, and how much it has depended on social institutions and economic conditions, we arrive at a conclusion which is analogous to the above, namely, that drive-satisfaction, and consequently the quality and strength of the drive, are at all times variable and therefore not measurable [with regard to their original condition]. In the talk on "Sexuality and Neurosis," I likewise came to the conclusion, based on observations regarding the sex drive of neurotics, that the apparently libidinous and sexual tendencies in the neurotic, as in the normal individual, in no way permit any conclusion regarding the strength or composition of his sex drive.

2. VALUES IN PLACE OF PLEASURE[17]

How then does the adaptation of a child to a given family environment take place? Let us recall how diversely the expressions of the child's organism shape themselves, even during the first months when it is still most possible to attain an over-all view. Some children can never get enough to eat, others are quite moderate; some refuse changes in diet, others want to eat everything. The same is true with regard to seeing, hearing, excretion, bathing, and relations to other persons of the environment. Yet already during the first days the child feels reassured if we take him into our arms. Educational influences which smooth the way for the child are of far-reaching significance here.

Already these first adaptations contain affective values in relation to the persons of the environment. The child is reassured, feels secure, loves,

and obeys, or he becomes insecure, timid, defiant, and disobedient. If one intervenes early with intelligent tactics, a condition results which might be described as one of carefree cheerfulness, and the child will hardly feel the coercion which is contained in every education. Mistakes in education, on the other hand, especially when the organs are insufficiently developed, lead to such frequent disadvantages and feelings of displeasure that the child seeks safeguards. By and large, two chief trends remain from this situation: over-submissiveness or rebellion and tendency toward independence. Obedience or defiance—the human psyche is capable of operating in either of these directions.

Both these direction-giving tendencies modify, change, inhibit, or excite every drive-impulse to such an extent that anything that manifests itself as an innate drive can be understood only from this point of view. "Fair is foul, and foul is fair," as the witches chant in *Macbeth*. Grief becomes joy, pain changes into pleasure, life is thrown away, death appears desirable—as soon as defiance interferes strongly. What the opponent loves will be hated, and what others discard will be highly valued. What culture prohibits, what parents and educators disadvise, precisely that will be chosen as the most ardently desired goal. An object or a person will attain value only if others will suffer in consequence. Defiant individuals will always persecute others, yet will always consider themselves persecuted. Thus a certain greed or hasty desire arises which has one analogy only, namely, the murderous struggle of all against all, the kindling of envy, avarice, vanity, and ambition in our modern society. The tension from person to person is too great in the neurotic; his drive desire is so intensified that in restless expectation he continuously chases after his triumph. The clinging to old childhood disorders, such as thumb sucking, enuresis, nail biting, and stuttering, is to be explained in this way. In cases where these tendencies, which are only apparently libidinous, have been permanently retained we can confidently speak of defiance.

The same holds for so-called early masturbation, sexual precocity, and premature sexual intercourse. I knew a seventeen-year-old girl from a good family who had frequent sexual intercourse from her fourteenth year on. At that she was frigid. Whenever she quarreled with her mother, which happened regularly at brief intervals, she always knew how to secure sexual intercourse for herself. Another girl wet the bed after each depreciation on the part of her mother, and soiled it as well. Poor progress in school, forgetfulness, lack of occupational satisfaction, and compulsion to sleep likewise reveal themselves as phenomena of protest in the neurotic. In the struggle with the opponent they are retained as valuable, I do not say as pleasurable.

3. THE BASIS OF THE NEUROTIC VALUE SYSTEM[18]

Where do this craving for significance, this joy in the perverse, this defiant clinging to disorders, these safeguarding measures take their origin? As you know, I have made two foci of psychological development responsible for this, which will be mentioned here only briefly. The one rests in the emergence of an increased inferiority feeling which I was always able to observe in connection with inferior organs. The other is a more or less distinct hint of an earlier fear of playing a feminine role. Both support the need of rebellion and the attitude of defiance to such an extent that neurotic traits will always develop, whether the individual concerned is considered well, is being treated for neurosis, or makes a name for himself as a genius or as a criminal.

4. SAFEGUARDING TENDENCIES IN PLACE OF REPRESSION[19]

But now to the main question: Through what does the neurotic become ill? When does his neurosis become manifest? Freud has paid less attention to this point. But we know that he assumes the cause to lie in an incident through which the repression is strengthened and the old psychological conflict is renewed. It cannot be denied that this lacks clarity. Perhaps the present discussion will help to solve the problem.

According to my experience with the neurotically disposed individual, who in fact suffers continually, it is any feeling of disparagement or even any expectation of it to which he responds with an acute or chronic attack. The latter gives us the time from which we date the onset of the neurosis. If new drive-repressions appear, these are only incidental phenomena which form under the accentuated pressure of the masculine protest and of the striving for significance and the safeguarding tendencies.

5. DEPRECIATION TENDENCY[20]

Incidentally, the "olfactory component" to which Freud repeatedly has attributed special significance as a libidinous component appears more and more as a neurotic fraud. A neurotic actress in talking about love affairs said: "I am not at all afraid of such affairs. I am actually com-

pletely amoral. There is only one thing: I have found that all men smell bad, and that violates my esthetic sense." We will understand that with such an attitude one can well afford to be amoral without incurring any danger. Europeans and Chinese, Americans and Negroes, Jews and Arians mutually reproach one another for their smell. A four-year-old boy says each time he passes by the kitchen, "It stinks." The cook is his enemy. We wish to call this phenomenon the depreciation tendency, a tendency which finds an analogy in the fable of the fox and the sour grapes. [See pp. 267–269.]

COMMENT *Regarding olfaction, Freud had made the following statement in a discussion of a case of obsessional neurosis: "I have come to recognize that a tendency to osphresiolagnia [erotic stimulation produced by odors], which has become extinct since childhood, may play a part in the genesis of neurosis, for instance, in certain forms of fetishism. And here I should like to raise the general question whether the atrophy of the sense of smell (which was an inevitable result of man's assumption of an erect posture) and the consequent organic repression of his osphresiolagnia may not have had a considerable share in the origin of his [man's] susceptibility to nervous diseases. This would afford us some explanation of why, with the advance of civilization, it is precisely the sexual life that must fall victim to repression. For we have long known the intimate connection in the animal organization between the sexual instinct and the function of the olfactory organ." (36, III, p. 382)*

From what does the depreciation tendency originate? It originates from the fear of an injury to one's own sensitivity. It is likewise a safeguarding tendency, initiated by the urge toward significance, and is psychologically of the same rank as the wish to be above, to celebrate sexual triumphs, to fly, or to stand on a ladder, staircase, or the gable of a house. One quite regularly finds in the neurotic that the tendencies to depreciate a woman and to have intercourse with her go closely together. (I have never yet met a neurotic who was not, at least secretly, beset by the fear that a woman might be superior to him.) The feelings of the neurotic express plainly: "I wish to depreciate the woman by sexual intercourse." Afterwards he is likely to leave her and to turn to others. I have called this the Don Juan characteristic of the neurotic. It corresponds to Freud's "love series" (*Liebesreihe*) which he interprets in a fantastic manner. Whether and how much libido is involved here is completely immaterial. The neurotic's masculine protest may also turn

to masturbation and pollution, not without associating these with safeguarding tendencies against the demon woman.

6. THE OEDIPUS COMPLEX[21]

What does such a patient "repress"—his sex drive, his libido? Of this he is so conscious that he thinks continuously of how to protect himself from it. A fantasy? His fantasy is in brief that woman is above him, that woman is the stronger. Much preparation is necessary to show the connection between this and similar fantasies and the neurosis. But then it turns out that this fantasy itself is only a warning, erected by the patient himself to obtain significance even by secret paths. Do such patients repress libidinal urges toward the mother; that is, do they suffer from the Oedipus complex? I have seen many patients who have come to know their Oedipus complex very well, without feeling any improvement. Once one appreciates the masculine protest in the Oedipus complex, one is no longer justified in speaking of a complex of fantasies and wishes. One will then learn to understand that the apparent Oedipus complex is only a small part of the overpowering neurotic dynamic, a stage of the masculine protest, a stage which in itself is insignificant although instructive in its context. It is a situation which must be taken symbolically and which yields important insights into the characterology of the neurotic, as other situations do.

F. Discussion of Adler's Ideas by Freud and Others

By Kenneth Mark Colby[22]

Since these particular meetings of the Psychoanalytic Society, held in January, 1911, [during which the preceding three selections were read] were of such crucial significance, a more factual account of what occurred should be of historical worth. Fortunately the verbatim statements of the discussants were recorded by the Society secretary. Copies of these minutes are now in the possession of Dr. Siegfried Bernfeld, who was good enough to make them available for study and who helped me in translating them from German into English. As accurate documents they are subject to the flaws of short-hand recording, perhaps missing emotional under- and overtones, but providing valuable additions and corrections to the inadequate reports available heretofore (16, 101, 119).

ever, be called tests of perception or of fantasy, corresponding to the older names for these devices, or better still tests of apperception, since they clearly involve the schema of apperception. Apperception, is, of course, the term chosen by Henry A. Murray for his well-known Thematic Apperception Test (85). In this connection, we should like to point out that Raymond B. Cattell recently described the presently current term of projective technique as "a serious misnomer . . . misleading to research design and clinical diagnosis" (23, p. 56). Instead, Cattell accepts apperception test as one of the most accurate alternatives (23, p. 94). This term would be in accord with Adlerian theory.

In daydreams of children and of adults, fantasy takes precisely that concrete direction which is supposed to serve the overcoming of a felt weakness. Disconnected to a certain extent from common sense, daydreams tend in the direction of the goal of superiority. This is easily understood as an attempt to compensate, to maintain the psychological equilibrium, which, however, is never accomplished in this way. The process is somewhat similar to that which the child takes in creating his style of life. Where he feels the difficulty, fantasy helps to give him an illusory view of the enhancement of his self-esteem, usually spurring him on at the same time. Certainly there are plenty of cases, however, where this latter incitement is lacking, where the fantasy, so to speak, is the compensation. Obviously such a situation is to be regarded as antisocial, even though it may be devoid of any activity or of any aggression against the environment.

Whenever the ambition of a person finds reality intolerable, he flees to the magic of fantasy. We do not want to forget, however, that when fantasy is rightly coupled with social interest, the really great achievements are to be expected, for fantasy, by rousing expectant feelings and emotions, has the same effect as increasing the gas pressure in a machine that is running: The performance is increased.

Night dreams, like daydreams, are phenomena accompanied by the desire to anticipate and appear when man is occupied with paving a path into the future and with walking it securely. The striking difference is that daydreams can still be understood while this is rarely the case with night dreams. For the present, it should be mentioned merely that in night dreams we again find the power line of an individual who wants to have a firm hold on the future, who is facing a problem, and who is attempting its solution. [For a full discussion of dreams see pp. 357–365.]

c. Character Traits and Expressive Movements

1. CHARACTER TRAITS[9]

The goal influences the philosophy of life, the pace and the schema of life of an individual and guides his expressive movements. The character traits are thus only the outer forms of the movement line of a person. As such they convey to us an understanding of his attitude toward the environment, his fellow man, the community at large, and his life problems. They are phenomena which represent means for achieving self-assertion. They are devices which join to form a method of living.

A character trait is comparable to a guiding line which is attached to the individual as a pattern, permitting him to express his self-consistent personality in any situation without much reflection. Character traits do not correspond to innate forces and substrata; they are acquired, although very early, in order to make it possible to retain a definite pace. For example, laziness is not innate. A child is lazy because this attribute appears to him as a suitable means to make life easier and at the same time to maintain his significance, for the power position of an individual exists, in a certain sense, also when he moves along the line of laziness. He can always refer to it as an innate defect, leaving his inner value intact. The end result of such a self-reflection is always approximately as follows: "If I did not have this defect, my abilities could develop brilliantly; but unfortunately I do have this defect." Another child who, in an unbridled striving for power, is engaged in a constant struggle with his environment will develop character traits which appear necessary for such a struggle: ambition, envy, distrust. It is generally believed that such phenomena are completely merged with a personality, that they are innate and unalterable. But closer examination shows that it is only that they appear necessary for the movement line of the individual and are adopted for this reason. They are not primary but secondary factors, forced by the secret goal of the individual, and must be understood teleologically.

All character traits reveal the degree of social interest. They run along the line which, according to the opinion of the individual, leads to the goal of superiority. They are guiding lines interwoven with the style of life which has formed them and which, again and again, brings them to light.

2. EXPRESSIVE MOVEMENTS[10]

The bodily postures and attitudes always indicate the manner in which an individual approaches his goal. A person who goes straight on shows courage, whereas an adult who is anxious and hesitant has a style of life that prohibits direct action, and something of a detour appears in every action. We can detect by the way in which an individual gives his hand whether he has social feeling and likes to be connected with others. A perfectly [ideally] normal handshake is rather rare; it is usually overdone, underdone, or betrays a pushing-off or pulling-to tendency. It is noticeable in a streetcar that some people lean sideways, showing that they wish to be supported and are quite oblivious of the convenience of others. The same social insensibility is seen in those who cough in front of others, quite thoughtless of infecting them. Some, in entering a room, seem to keep instinctively at the greatest possible distance from everyone else. All these things reveal, more directly than their conversation, the attitudes that individuals assume towards life.

Among the authors who have well understood the foundations and certain expositions of the problems treated here we must mention primarily Ludwig Klages. In his *Problems of Graphology* and in *The Principles of Characterology*, he reports specific results of his theory of expressive movements. But already in 1905 he had developed thoughts regarding the form of personal expression which we wish to cite here (with the author's permission) on account of their significance and classical form.

"Every inner activity, in as far as it is not counteracted by opposing forces, is accompanied by a movement which is analogous to the original activity. This is the basic law of expression and its interpretation. To the most general characteristics of the inner activity, for example, the following movements must correspond: to striving, advancing movements; to resistance, retreating movements; to inner progress, a continuation of movement; to standstill, interruption of movement; to feelings of resistance, inhibition and tension, those movements will correspond which are directed against physical resistance and thus arouse increased pressure sensations (making a fist).

"Of the greatest importance to psychology are metaphors which name inner processes according to certain functions and organs of the body. For example, irony is brought in relation to the teeth by giving it the attribute 'biting;' pendantry is brought in relation to the bones by calling it 'calcified.' Among such phrases the ancient differentiation between 'head' and 'heart' is of greatest significance, for example, 'he has no head' versus 'he has no heart,' one referring to the absence of insight, the other to the absence of kindness."

In continuation of these thoughts, Klages arrives at the conclusion that "expressive movement is a general simile in terms of action." Considerations which were in many respects similar led me later to the conclusion that expressive movement, action, emotion, physiognomy, and all other psychological phenomena, including the pathological ones, are a simile of the unconsciously posited and effective life plan.

In order to arrive at a more effective result, the psyche speaks an organ dialect. In mimic and physiognomy, in the expressive movements of the emotions, in rhythms of the dance and of religious ecstacy, in pantomime, in art, and most eloquently in music, this organ dialect renounces language as a means of communication in order to impress us the more. Such effects are easily permitted by the communality of a given culture and the similarity of the human sense organs. These effects do not render the unambiguity of the word, but rather the stronger resonance of pictorial language, and thus betray their tendency to prevail as special devices where the spoken word fails to gain dominance and superiority beyond the limits of the ordinary.

COMMENT *The selection above is from the original paper on organ dialect (1912c), where this term was used broadly to include nonverbal communication. Adler's later meaning of organ dialect was restricted to the functions of the body (see below).*

3. SLEEP POSTURES[11]

By comparing the sleeping postures of patients in various hospitals with the reports of their daily life, I have concluded that the mental attitude is consistently expressed in both modes of life, sleeping and waking.

Very little children sleep upon their backs, with the arms raised, and when we see a child sleeping in this position, we may assume that he is healthy. If the child changes this position and sleeps with the arms down, for example, some illness is to be suspected. Similarly, if an adult is accustomed to sleep in a certain position and suddenly changes it, we may assume that something is altered in his mental attitude.

When we see a person sleeping upon the back, stretched out like a soldier at attention, it is a sign that he wishes to appear as great as possible.

If he lies curled up like a hedgehog with the sheet drawn over his head, he is not likely to be a striving or courageous character but is probably cowardly. A person who sleeps on his stomach betrays a stubbornness and negativity.

Some people turn a gradual somersault in sleep and awake with their heads at the bottom of the bed and their feet on the pillow. Such people are in unusually strong opposition to the world. Other patients make a halfturn and sleep with their heads hanging down over the edge of the mattress; they develop headaches from this practice, which are generally used to escape the demands of the following day. All sleep postures have a purposive nature. Restless sleepers, who keep moving all night, show that they are dissatisfied and want to be doing something more than they are. It may also be a sign that they want to be watched by another person, usually by the mother. When children cry in sleep, it is for the same reason. They do not want to be alone but would like to ensure notice and protection. The quietest sleepers are those who are most settled in their attitude to the problems of life. Their lives being well organized by day, they can use the night for its proper purpose of rest and recreation, and their sleep is generally free from dreaming.

D. Organ Dialect

COMMENT *The interaction of body and mind as a unit, the psychosomatic problem, was Adler's original concern in his* Study of Organ Inferiority *(1907a). In this early monograph it was the organ inferiority which, through the "psychological superstructure," gave rise to certain compensatory psychological and bodily processes. Although Adler referred "all phenomena of neuroses back to organ inferiority" (1907a, p. 63), it should be mentioned that even then he was far from stating the reverse, namely, that all organ inferiority leads to failure.*

In his subsequent shift of emphasis from the primacy of bodily processes to the primacy of psychological processes, the organ inferiority lost its causal position and assumed two new functions. First, it became one of the important objective factors which provide certain probabilities for the individual's development (see pp. 368–369), such factors being ultimately subject to the individual's own interpretation. Second, the inferior organ, as the point of least resistance, became the preferred means by which the psyche expressed itself through the body. This second function is the topic of the present section.

1. ORGAN FUNCTIONS AS EXPRESSIVE BEHAVIOR[12]

Through recognition of the law of movement, we arrive at the purpose and meaning of expressive movements, which may be words, thoughts, feelings, and actions. But the body is also subject to the law of movement. This is disclosed when we consider the meaning of its functions. These speak a language which is usually more expressive and discloses the individual's opinion more clearly than words are able to do. Still it is a language, the language of the body, which I have called organ dialect. For example, a man who pretends to be courageous and possibly even believes in his courage shows by his trembling and palpitation that he has lost his equanimity. A child who behaves obediently but wets the bed at night thereby manifests clearly his opinion not to wish to submit to the prescribed culture.

Enuresis generally serves the purpose of attracting notice, of subordinating others, and of occupying their attention in the nighttime as well as the day. Sometimes it is to antagonize them. The habit is a declaration of enmity. From every angle, we can see that enuresis is really a creative expression, for the child is speaking with his bladder instead of his mouth.

We should like to point briefly to the following further examples of organ dialect. The refusal of normal functions may be an expression of defiance; pain, an expression of jealousy and desire; insomnia, of ambition; over-sensitivity, anxiety, and nervous organic disorders, of craving for power. Occasionally sexual excitations arise in this connection as coordinated forms of expressive movements.

To a certain degree, every emotion finds some bodily expression. The individual will show his emotion in some visible form, perhaps in his posture and attitude, perhaps in his face, perhaps in the trembling of his legs and knees. Similar changes could be found in the organs themselves. If he flushes or turns pale, for example, the circulation of the blood is affected. In anger, anxiety, sorrow, or any other emotion, the body always speaks. The mind is able to activate the physical conditions. The emotions and their physical expressions tell us how the mind is acting and reacting in a situation which it interprets as favorable or unfavorable.

2. THE MECHANISM OF ORGAN DIALECT[13]

The means by which the body is influenced have never been completely explored, and we shall probably never have a full account of them. A mental tension affects both the central nervous system and the au-